

THE GIPPER COMES TO CHINA

By **Jeff Weniger**, CFA, Asset Allocation Strategist

Talk of U.S. protectionism continues to dominate stock market action. With President Donald Trump focusing on the lopsided US\$389 billion trade deficit with China,¹ the S&P 500 China Index CAD, which is tracked by the WisdomTree ICBCCS S&P China 500 Index ETF (CHNA.B), has fallen 17% since January 26, 2018.²

A handful of fears have led Chinese equities down: the Federal Reserve raising rates, Chinese money markets being more heavily regulated by the People's Bank of China, fears of a property bubble and the prospect of a trade war with the U.S. are among the leading factors. But amid all of this, few strategists seem to know or care about the Ronald Reagan-esque tax cuts announced by Beijing this year.

In fact, the lack of excitement about Chinese fiscal stimulus may be our most eyebrow-raising development for 2018—and we imagine it is just a matter of time before the market comes to appreciate the extent to which Beijing has channeled Reagan, “the Gipper.” Let the market focus on the trade war, because astute observers may note an opportunity from value-added tax (VAT) cuts and what we calculate as a *halving in personal income tax liabilities* of everyday Chinese later this year.

SLASHING RATES FOR THE CONSUMPTION ECONOMY

In our research, we have been pointing out that China's plan ever since Deng Xiaoping replaced Mao Zedong as Chinese leader in 1978 was to famously “bide its time,” grow its wealth and then “go out.” The last part, the going out, describes a muscled power colonizing vast territories to its south and west. The industrialized nations, constrained by guilt over their own colonial past, choose to watch from the sidelines. Chinese colonization in the form of infrastructure investment and loans and the spreading of cultural soft power is set to influence southeastern and central Asia, Africa and Latin America.

But inside its own borders, Beijing wants to transition from being “manufacturer to the world” to one where its own citizens ratchet up their consumption. A potential eight-year battle with President Trump accelerates the urgency.

¹ Source: U.S. Census Bureau, through 5/31/18

² Source: Bloomberg, WisdomTree. Data through 8/27/18.

EIGHT YEARS VS. TRUMP?

With Trump in office, the Chinese economic model built on manufacturing cheap goods and dumping them on the Port of Long Beach will have to change. Also, the days of stealing intellectual property, especially in technology, and ethical legerdemain such as “knocking off” Nike shoes and Coach purses probably are numbered. As these tactics disappear, so too will China’s ability to claim poverty at the World Trade Organization, which has allowed it to levy higher tariffs than the industrialized economies.

We think many analysts are operating under the assumption that Trump will necessarily lose in 2020, yet his real money re-election odds are currently priced in the mid-30% range.³ Beijing is no doubt doing the math, realizing that the lopsided trade arrangements of the past have little chance of surviving through this year, let alone through 2024 in the Trump-for-eight-years scenario.

The nature of the Chinese economy must change, and Beijing’s tool for accelerating that change is a two-pronged attack on VAT taxes and personal income taxes to spur domestic consumption.

VAT REFORM

With Trump threatening to impose tariffs on maybe the full US\$457 billion (C\$597 billion) of Chinese goods and services it exports to the U.S.,⁴ China sought pain relief in May by cutting VAT taxes on a handful of industries. Wall Street made little note of the development. According to China’s State Council, these cuts will chop the VAT burden by CNY240 billion (C\$46.5 billion) this year alone.⁵

Since budget analysts tend to use 10-year outlooks, figure 1 shows the sensitivity analysis of the potential VAT savings for that horizon. With China’s second-quarter real gross domestic product (GDP) growth of 6.7%, while consumer price inflation was 1.9% in June, exactly equal to its five-year average, nominal GDP growth may be around 8.6% at present. Lopping a couple percentage points off that figure to be conservative in forecasting, it may be reasonable to foresee manufacturing output growing 6% to 7% in the coming years. If so, the cumulative effect of this spring’s cuts is CNY3,163 billion to CNY3,316 billion (C\$613 billion to C\$642 billion) over 10 years.

³ Natural odds of victory in a square wager on a venture at 17-10 odds (his price at William Hill, the publicly-listed London Bookmaker) equals 10 divided by the sum of 17 and 10, or 10/27ths (37%). This assumes the bookmaker takes no vigorish, or premium for booking the wager, which is not the case. This means that if William Hill has set a market-clearing price on a Trump victory, true natural odds are a bit lower than 37% when accounting for the house take.

⁴ Source: Customs General Administration PRC, through 6/30/18. Unless otherwise noted, all exchange rates in this report as of 7/24/2018.

⁵ Source: “China to Cut VAT Tax Rates for Manufacturing and Other Sectors: State Media,” Reuters, 3/28/18.

Figure 1: Estimated 10 Year Tax Savings, Value-Added Tax

	Production Growth Rate										
	0%	1%	2%	3%	4%	5%	6%	7%	8%	9%	10%
2018	240	240	240	240	240	240	240	240	240	240	240
2019	240	242	245	247	250	252	254	257	259	262	264
2020	240	245	250	255	260	265	270	275	280	285	290
2021	240	247	255	262	270	278	286	294	302	311	319
2022	240	250	260	270	281	292	303	315	327	339	351
2023	240	252	265	278	292	306	321	337	353	369	387
2024	240	255	270	287	304	322	340	360	381	403	425
2025	240	257	276	295	316	338	361	385	411	439	468
2026	240	260	281	304	328	355	383	412	444	478	514
2027	240	262	287	313	342	372	405	441	480	521	566
Sum (CNY)	2,400	2,511	2,628	2,751	2,881	3,019	3,163	3,316	3,477	3,646	3,825
Sum (CAD)	465	486	509	533	558	585	613	642	674	706	741

Annual Savings

Source: WisdomTree. Sensitivity analysis, extrapolating this year’s estimated CNY240 billion in VAT tax cuts forward.

And that’s just the start. Income tax cuts are also being discussed, and some estimate that the total value of all tax reductions over the next 10 years may amount to US\$1.5 trillion to US\$2.0 trillion (C\$1.96 trillion to C\$2.61 trillion), equaling or exceeding the US\$1.5 trillion (C\$1.96 trillion) Trump tax cuts.⁶

INCOME TAXES

Figure 2 lays out Beijing’s plan for the income tax code. In the outline, which could be law by October and in effect for 2019, the *monthly* individual income tax exemption rises by CNY1,500 to CNY5,000. That’s just the start. Notice the huge jumps in the lower eligibility bounds for the 10%, 20% and 25% brackets. Additionally, discussions include allowing deductions for tuition, medical expenses and mortgage payments.

⁶ Christopher Balding, “Tax Cuts Feed China’s Consuming Passion,” Bloomberg Opinion, 6/20/18.

Figure 2: China Personal Income Tax Code

Tax Rate (%)	Current Tax Code		New Tax Code	
	Monthly Taxable Income (CNY)		Monthly Taxable Income (CNY)	
	Lower Bound	Upper Bound	Lower Bound	Upper Bound
3%	0	1,500	0	3,000
10%	1,500	4,500	3,000	12,000
20%	4,500	9,000	12,000	25,000
25%	9,000	35,000	25,000	35,000
30%	35,000	55,000	35,000	55,000
35%	55,000	80,000	55,000	80,000
45%	80,000	--	80,000	--
	Current Exemption 3,500		Proposed New Exemption 5,000	

Source: China International Capital Corp. Table reproduced from the Financial Times, "China Plans Income Tax Cut to Boost Consumption and Reduce Inequality," 7/2/18.

WHITE-COLLAR MATH

Figure 3 shows what will happen to a white-collar worker making CNY15,000 per month (C\$2,906), a wage that is common in a city like Shanghai, where median income was C\$2,049 per month in 2017.⁷

The current regime has this person paying C\$4,348 in annual taxes on yearly gross wages of C\$34,874. Under the new tax code, his or her tax liability falls 58% to C\$1,837, a savings of about C\$2,500. Such numbers make Reagan look like Trotsky.

⁷ Source: Kenneth Rapoza, "China Wage Levels Equal to or Surpass Parts of Europe," Forbes, 8/16/17.

Figure 3: Individual Tax Liability, Wage of CNY15,000 per Month (\$2,242)

	Old Tax Code		New Tax Code		
Monthly Gross Income (CNY)	15,000		15,000		
Exemption (CNY)	3,500		5,000		
Taxable Income (CNY)	11,500		10,000		
Marginal Rate	Amt. of Income in Each Bracket	Tax Due	Amt. of Income in Each Bracket	Tax Due	
3%	1,500	45	3,000	90	
10%	3,000	300	7,000	700	
20%	4,500	900	0	0	
25%	2,500	625	0	0	
Monthly Tax (CNY)		1,870		790	Savings 1,080
Yearly Tax (CNY)		22,440		9,480	12,960
Monthly Tax (CAD)		362		153	209
Yearly Tax (CAD)		4,348		1,837	2,511

Savings 58%

Source: WisdomTree. New tax code is if the proposal of record in July 2018 becomes law. Subject to change.

Take the worker of lesser means, who makes half the first worker’s compensation. This person, who grosses CNY7,500 per month, currently has the first CNY3,500 exempted from taxes, leaving CNY4,000 subject to tax. Their tax due is CNY295 per month. That same worker in the new regime doesn’t even hit the second bracket, so their liability falls 75% to CNY75 per month. In Canadian dollars, this person who makes \$17,437 per year is set to witness his or her taxes cut by \$511 next year.

WILLING THE CONSUMER IMPULSE

Anticipating a fraying of relations with the industrialized powers, although more so with Washington than Ottawa, Beijing sees a ripe time to transition to a consumption-based economy. It appears the regime is playing the “go big or go home” strategy on taxes.

Thus far, the shift to consumption is working, somewhat, but more work is to be done. While private consumption-to-GDP rose to 39.1% in 2017 from 35.6% in 2010, it is still barely half the levels seen in the U.S., where it is 69%, and also considerably lower than Canada’s 57.9%.⁸ But while the pace of catch-up feels slow, China’s supercharged economic growth, even in the current “slow” era, has allowed retail sales to jump 9% in the year to June, on top of 11% and 10.6% growth rates in the two prior years. This pace allows retail activity—in a country of 1.4 billion people—to double every seven years or so.

⁸ China source: CEIC Data, as of 2017. U.S. source: St. Louis Fed, as of 3/31/18.

The China of 2018 already sports superpower companies such as Alibaba and Tencent, players that are as strong and as world-changing as Google or Amazon. And with per capita GDP of US\$8,827 (C\$11,526), about equal to that of Mexico, Kazakhstan and Bulgaria,⁹ China is still short of the middle-income range. But consumption-based companies aren't hesitating. For an idea of scale, Starbucks is opening a new store in China every 15 hours, while Tim Hortons will open "only" 1,500 stores in the country in the next decade.¹⁰

But Xi Jinping is growing impatient, seeing the transition pace as too slow. Tax cuts are the electric jolt.

2018 XI = 1981 REAGAN?

For adherents to supply-side economics, the philosophy that generally says that tax cuts stimulate economies, comparing Reagan's 1981 tax cuts with what may become Chinese law this October is a worthy exercise.

When Reagan was sworn into office in January 1981, the U.S. was mired in a double-dip recession. Reagan's tax changes reduced the top marginal bracket from 70% to 50% (reducing it to 28% in the Tax Reform Act of 1986), while providing family-friendly boosts to child tax credits.

His tax reform and "morning in America" message helped the U.S. economy create 3.5 million jobs in 1983, continuing into 1984 with an average 346,000 monthly jobs added in the first three quarters of 1984, right before the November election. Walter Mondale, the Democratic challenger, didn't stand a chance, carrying just his home state of Minnesota and solidly Democratic Washington, D.C. The landslide stands to this day as the presidential equivalent of Secretariat's 31-length romp "like a tremendous machine" in the 1973 Belmont Stakes. The economic expansion persisted until the 1990 Gulf War, uninterrupted by the 1985 Saudi-induced oil price spike and the 1987 stock market crash.

China has many reasons for channeling Reagan. For one, the politburo needs to find a way to alleviate the potential pain from a reversal in runaway home prices. According to Numbeo, the Shanghai home price-to-income ratio has risen to 44.5, about four times that of New York City (11.9) and considerably higher than Vancouver's 16.9.¹¹ Meanwhile, both the U.S. Fed and the Bank of Canada are tightening monetary policy, while the European Central Bank is set to end its €30 billion-per-month bond-buying program this year. Even the Bank of England may raise rates by a half a point by the end of next year, if the Wall Street consensus is correct. While all of this is happening, Trump's fists are clenched at the bargaining table.

Tax cuts make sense for Xi. Sure, his rubber-stamp politburo granted him the ability to be president for life, but the Chinese Communist Party (CCP), like every autocracy, still needs to have some level of public support to avoid overthrow. For 29 years, ever since the CCP showed its true colors in Tiananmen, Beijing's social contract has been to deliver economic expansion in exchange for a lack of political liberty.

Chinese society has stayed unified, but Xi must continue to deliver on the economic front to maintain power.

⁹ Source: World Bank, 2017. \$8,903, \$8,838 and \$8,031, respectively.

¹⁰ Source: Starbucks from CNBC, 12/5/17, Tim Hortons from the Toronto Star, 7/16/18.

¹¹ Sourced on 7/23/18.

THE MARKET'S FOCUS

For whatever reason, while the Trump tax cuts were met with much pomp and circumstance, nary a word is spoken about two major Chinese tax initiatives taking place this year. Money is made in markets by observing events and information that are under- or overestimated by the public, then acting. We are not sure why the Xi-as-Reagan thesis hasn't taken hold, and that means opportunity looms.

With both the U.S. and China taking a scythe to their tax codes—and some talk in GOP circles of another round of cuts if the so-called Democratic blue wave¹² doesn't materialize in U.S. midterm elections—maybe the focus should be on this environment's embrace of Reaganomics, not trade wars.

WisdomTree's TSX-listed China ETF (CHNA.B) covers the S&P 500 of China, so it is designed to be a portfolio's sole China holding.

CHINESE EQUITY VALUATIONS

With many Chinese equity markets having achieved bear market status in 2018 by falling 20% or more, equity valuations have subsided to the point that the S&P China 500 Index CAD is trading at 11.9x forward earnings, several multiple points south of the U.S. S&P 500 (P/E of 18.0) and the S&P/TSX Composite (P/E of 15.8).¹³ This valuation is all the more surprising because CHNA.B, which tracks the index, has 16.7% of its weight in Tencent and Alibaba, which have seen their valuations rise amid the FAANGs and BATs phenomenon.¹⁴

Additionally, for those worried about trade conflict, the People's Bank of China has been able to stealthily fight the war via the currency market, even though it claims it isn't actively trying to weaken the currency. After appreciating relative to the greenback – the currency everyone is watching – in 2017, the yuan hit peak strength at CNY6.269 in April. But it has turned tail ever since, heading in the direction of 7.0 this summer.¹⁵ Some investors are concerned that yuan weakness spurred the risk aversion in markets in late 2015 and early 2016. However, note that Beijing fought capital flight because of what was a C\$5.2 trillion foreign exchange hoard in 2014. Today, after waging that battle, it maintains a formidable C\$4 trillion war chest if capital flight becomes an issue once again.

With everyday Chinese poised to see their taxes cut by half or more, Westerners could only wish to see such personal tax relief. The Street doesn't care. Clutch a photo of the Gipper in the cowboy hat and assess accordingly.

¹² Blue wave: The theory that voters will come out in size to vote for Democrats (political color blue) in November midterm elections.

¹³ Source: Bloomberg, as of 8/27/18.

¹⁴ As of 8/27/18. Source: WisdomTree. FAANGs = Facebook, Apple, Amazon, Netflix and Google parent Alphabet, which have been market leaders in recent years. BATs = the Chinese equivalent, comprised of Baidu, Alibaba and Tencent.

¹⁵ CNY6.81 = US\$1, 8/27/18.

The WisdomTree exchange-traded funds (ETFs) listed on the Toronto Stock Exchange are managed by WisdomTree Asset Management Canada, Inc. Commissions, management fees and expenses all may be associated with investing in WisdomTree ETFs. Please read the relevant prospectus before investing, which is available at WisdomTree.com. WisdomTree ETFs are not guaranteed, their values change frequently and past performance may not be repeated. Nothing in any commentary should be considered a recommendation to buy or sell a particular security. Tax, investment and all other decisions should be made, as appropriate, only with guidance from a qualified professional.

The S&P China 500 Index CAD (the "Index") underlying the WisdomTree ICBCCS S&P China 500 Index ETF (the "Fund") managed by WisdomTree Asset Management Canada, Inc. (the "Manager"), is proprietary to S&P Dow Jones Indices LLC ("S&P DJI"). S&P® and the names identifying the Index are trademarks of Standard & Poor's Financial Services LLC and have been licensed for use by S&P DJI and sublicensed for certain purposes by the Manager. The Fund based on the Index is not in any way sponsored, endorsed, sold or promoted by S&P DJI, its affiliates or licensors and those parties make no representations or warranties, express or implied, regarding the advisability of investing in securities generally or in the Fund particularly or the ability of the Index to track general market performance.

© 2018 WisdomTree Asset Management Canada, Inc. WisdomTree is a registered trademark of WisdomTree Investments, Inc., or its subsidiaries in the United States and elsewhere. Used with permission.

Published: 9/5/18

WisdomTree.com ■ **866.893.8733**

